MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING OF THE AIRPORT COMMISSION

1. CALL TO ORDER

The Torrance Airport Commission convened in a regular session on Thursday, October 10, 2013 at 7:00 p.m. in the West Annex meeting room at Torrance City Hall.

2. ROLL CALL

Present: Commissioners Boyce, Donnellan, Jacobsen,

Johnson, and Chairperson Glass.

Absent: Commissioners Hsiao and Orpe.

Also Present: Facility Operations Manager Megerdichian and

Business Manager Williams.

<u>MOTION</u>: Commissioner Donnellan moved to grant Commissioners Hsiao and Orpe excused absences for the October 10, 2013 Commission meeting. Commissioner Jacobsen seconded the motion; a voice vote reflected unanimous approval.

3. FLAG SALUTE

Commissioner Johnson led the Pledge of Allegiance.

4. <u>AFFIDAVIT OF AGENDA POSTING</u>

<u>MOTION</u>: Commissioner Jacobsen, seconded by Commissioner Johnson, moved to accept and file the report of the City Clerk on the posting of the agenda for this meeting; a voice vote reflected unanimous approval.

5. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

5A. MINUTES OF SEPTEMBER 12, 2013

Chairperson Glass offered the following clarification: Page 1, 5A. "Commissioner Johnson offered his observation that cars for sale are being parked in the lot <u>formerly occupied by the farmer..."</u>

MOTION: Commissioner Jacobsen moved to approve the September 12, 2013 Commission meeting minutes as amended. Commissioner Donnellan seconded the motion; a voice vote reflected unanimous approval (absent Commissioners Hsiao and Orpe).

6. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS #1 AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

None.

7. ACTION ITEMS

7A. THREE MONTH REVIEW OF AVIAD LLC BANNER TOW BUSINESS

Facility Operations Manager Megerdichian provided background on Aviad's banner tow operations at the Airport that began on July 4, 2013. He reported that Aviad has flown 60-75 flights during this time period, primarily on weekends. He noted that initially they operated from Area B at midfield; however, per instructions from the FAA, Aviad relocated on July 27 to Area A, the same area as Star Ads. He called attention to the list of noise and early left-turn violations attributed to Aviad's three aircraft and responses received from neighboring cities (Attachment A) regarding banner tow aircraft since July 4. He requested that the Commission conduct a three-month review and make a recommendation to City Council for Aviad to continue or discontinue banner tow operations at the Airport.

Wayne Mansfield, President, Aviad, stated that his business has contributed approximately \$60,000 in hangar fees, fuel purchases, maintenance, and associated costs since their operations began on July 4. He noted that they have created five permanent positions and have served their clients well. He recognized that there have been community concerns but maintained that there have been no noise violations since their relocation, noting that he considers the issue resolved. He pointed out that the letters of violations were sent back east and that there was a three-week lag when he was unaware of the problem. He assured the Commission that they are trying to be good neighbors and welcomed residents to contact him directly with any concerns.

Nick Taylor, Chief of Flight Operations, Aviad, explained why operating halfway down the runway at Area A midfield caused the three noise violations, noting that noise meters have not been violated since the relocation to the threshold of Runway 29 Right. He stated that the two early left-turn violations were for safety reasons, one due to oncoming traffic and the other due to a fog bank. He noted that they would continue to work with the Noise Abatement office to test routes and to fly as quietly as possible.

Responding to Commissioner Boyce's inquiry, Mr. Mansfield stated that Aviad uses three of the same type aircraft, but normally just use two.

Richard Root, Via Buena Ventura, received clarification from staff that 60-75 flights is an estimate and that Aviad's permit does not limit the number of flights. He stated that a 6.75% to 8% violation rate is a concern, that last summer there were five times more banner tow operations than previous summers, and that when they fly slowly over the Riviera area at 1,000 feet the noise meters do not register the noise. He maintained that citizen complaints are not valid and read a section from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) that requires a city to follow guidelines before approving a permit. He urged the Commission to revoke the permit until a study has been conducted to determine environmental effects and noise impacts.

Facility Operations Manager Megerdichian stated that staff did not receive direction to conduct an initial review under CEQA or an Environmental Impact Report, that the City is going through a stringent process to allow Aviad to operate at the Airport, and that staff believes this is the appropriate way to analyze their first three months.

John Bailey, Walnut Street, President, Southeast Torrance Homeowners Association, noted that staff has not made a recommendation to approve or disapprove and pointed out that noise meters do not measure noise over southeast Torrance or Lomita. He questioned if Star Ads has received any noise violations and recommended that the City look at the first noise tests that were conducted to determine how large the impact is on the City and surrounding communities before making any decision.

Barry Jay, Brian Avenue, President, Torrance Airport Association, stated that Aviad has demonstrated that they are operating safely, are working well with Star Ads, and are willing to work with residents to mitigate noise concerns. On behalf of Torrance Airport Association, he stated that there is no reason to stop Aviad's operations at this time.

Nancy Mansfield-Staudt, Paseo de las Delicias, voiced concern about noise from banner tow operations and helicopters. She concurred with Mr. Root that further research and studies should be conducted and that there should be more input from the community before a decision is made.

Richard Seals, South Bay Aviation, stated that both banner tow operators work hard to follow noise procedures. He noted that it was unfair that Aviad was initially asked to operate from midfield and that at times aircraft have to deviate because of air traffic and weather issues. He stated that Aviad should not be held responsible for deviations and the initial location that they flew from.

Wayne Mansfield stated that the noise violation rate is 0% since they moved their operations to Area A, that summer is the busiest time of year, and that people who complain about banner tow operations also complain about helicopter noise. Referring to CEQA, he asserted that Aviad is not a project but a 60 year old business that operates under the guidance of the FAA and environmental impact studies do not apply.

Facility Operations Manager Megerdichian stated that he has received no complaints from either banner tow operator about the other, and Mr. Mansfield added that Mr. Lopez from Star Ads has been very gracious in working with Aviad.

Commissioner Donnellan inquired about an October 10, 2013 <u>Daily Breeze</u> article and Mr. Mansfield responded that he was misquoted.

Commissioner Boyce inquired about projections for the remainder of the year and Mr. Mansfield stated that there would be a significant reduction to one or two flights per week.

Commissioner Jacobsen expressed concern that there has not been enough outreach to the community and that three months is too short of time to make an adequate review. He received clarification from staff that homeowners associations were not contacted and that the Commission recommended a six-month review but that City Council changed it to three months.

Commissioner Donnellan voiced his concern about the high incidence of noise violations and offered his observation that most residents do not call in to complain.

Commissioner Boyce stated that there have been no noise violations since Aviad moved to Area A and that the time period is too short to make a full assessment.

<u>MOTION</u>: Commissioner Donnellan, seconded by Commissioner Jacobsen, moved to recommend to City Council to rescind the permit and for Aviad to discontinue banner tow operations at the Airport. The motion failed to pass on a 2-3 roll call vote (absent Commissioners Hsiao and Orpe).

MOTION: Chairperson Glass moved to recommend to City Council to allow Aviad to continue banner tow operations at the Airport and to extend the review period for an additional three months. Commissioner Boyce seconded the motion. The motion passed on a 4-1 roll call vote (absent Commissioners Hsiao and Orpe).

8. <u>INFORMATION ITEMS</u>

8A. <u>AERONAUTICAL OPERATIONAL INFORMATION UNDER THE PURVIEW OF THE GENERAL SERVICES DEPARTMENT</u>

Chairperson Glass noted that the following reports for October 2013 were included in agenda materials: Hangar and Tiedown Rental Status, Ongoing Projects, October Meeting Room Calendar, Hangar Waiting List, Events Requiring Emergency Response for August-September 2013, and Airfield Operations Status for August 2013.

Facility Operations Manager Megerdichian reported that there are currently two hangar vacancies. Referring to Report #2, he noted that the Airport Security Project redesign is 100% complete, with bid opening in November and award of contract in December 2013.

In response to Chairperson Glass's inquiry, he stated that equipment for the Alternate Emergency Operation Center (AEOC) would be stored in an expanded storage area inside the GAC and that they are also looking at external storage options.

9. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS #2

- **9A.** Commissioner Boyce initiated a brief discussion about ways the Airport could outreach more positively to the community and raised the possibility of offering scholarships to high school students. There was concurrence to direct staff to bring back an item on community outreach at a future date.
- **9B**. Nancy Mansfield-Staudt, Paseo de las Delicias, stated that she loves Torrance Airport but hates the noise that keeps increasing over her home and suggested offering school field trips to the Airport.
- **9C.** John Staudt, Paseo de las Delicias, stated that the biggest problem in the Riviera area is noise from helicopters.

10. ADJOURNMENT

MOTION: At 8:22 p.m., Commissioner Johnson moved to adjourn the meeting to Thursday, November 14, 2013 in the West Annex meeting room at 7:00 p.m.

Commissioner Jacobsen seconded the motion and, hearing no objection, Chairperson Glass so ordered.

###

Approved as submitted November 11, 2013 s/ Sue Herbers, City Clerk